

ALHB-LHS Analysis

By Jake Zabel (2015)

Between the *Australian Lutheran Hymn Book* and the *Lutheran Hymnal with Supplement* there are four orders of service which offer Holy Communion, *the Order of Morning Service with Holy Communion*, *Another Order of Service with Holy Communion*, *the Service with Communion*, *Service-Alternative Form*. While three of these orders are very similar and share the same chief focus, one order stands out from the rest with a completely different focus than the others.

Brief History of the ALHB and the LHS

In 1922 the *Evangelical Lutheran Synod of Australia* (ELSA) published their own hymn book the *Australian Lutheran Hymn Book* (ALHB), with the tune edition coming out later in 1925. “*Although this started out as an ELSA venture, it was later widely used in the UELCA, and became a quiet force in bringing the two churches together.*” (Lockwood-Kummerow: 3) The UELCA (*United Evangelical Lutheran Church in Australia*) did not have their own hymn book, instead they used the ALHB. The UELCA made a few changes to the ALHB, publishing a new tune book and an appendix to the ALHB in the 1940’s. These publications of the UELCA prompted the ELSA, now known as ELCA, to consider a revision of their hymn book. At the 1947 ELCA general convention a liturgics committee was appointed the task of revising the ALHB. The UELCA, having been using the ALHB, sought to combine their efforts with the ELCA to produce a common hymnal for all Lutheran churches in Australia. The UELCA’s proposal was knocked back by the ELCA but eventually they agreed to work on a combined hymnal, deciding that it would be better to publish a new hymnal instead of simply revising the old one.

From 1951 onwards the two committees worked together to produce a new hymnal; joining together in 1952 to become a single committee. The final product was not released until 1973, several years after the 1966 Union of the ELCA and UELCA.

In 1959 a sub-committee was formed to focus their efforts on an order of service, which was completed in time for the Union in 1966. This new order of service was used for the first time on October 29th 1966 at the Tanunda Show Hall for the opening service of the first convention of the newly formed *Lutheran Church of Australia* (LCA).

In 1973 the LCA would finally release their own hymnal, the *Lutheran Hymnal* (LH). And so the newly united church had a new liturgy and new hymnbook, but “*in some ways the LH came out at just the wrong time.*” (Schubert: 4) The hymnal had taken over twenty years to be produced and had been released too late. Vatican II had come and gone, bringing with it a modernisation of the old liturgy. The American Lutherans were already producing contemporary worship booklets and the ‘thees’ and ‘thous’ of the LH were now things of the past. Therefore, in 1987 the LCA released the new modernised *Supplement to the Lutheran Hymnal* which was then added to LH and the two were released together in 1989 in the *Lutheran Hymnal with Supplement* (LHS). The LHS retained the order of service from the LH with only some alterations:

“*Most of the changes were to do with making the language more modern and did not substantially change the content.*” (Lockwood-Kummerow: 8)

The Four Orders of Communion

Across the ALHB and the LHS there are four Holy Communion orders of service. From here on *The Order of Morning Service with Holy Communion* from the ALHB shall be referred to as the Pg1 order, the *Another Order of Service with Holy Communion* from the ALHB shall be referred to as Pg10, *The Service with Communion* from the LHS shall be referred to as Pg6 (if however I wish to refer to its early form from the LH I shall refer to it as Pg1LH in order to differentiate between it and the Pg1 order from the ALHB), and *The Service-Alternative Form* shall be referred to as Pg58.

In order to understand the differences between these four orders we need to take a quick look at the origins of all four orders. This takes us back to 1885 America, when three Lutheran synods worked together to produce a common order of service in English. In 1888 the *Common Order* was produced and widely used across America. But while America was adopting a new English order of service, the Australian Lutherans were holding fast to their German services. This would all change with the events of World War 1, which resulted in a necessary transition from German to English (Leske: 178). Thus, in 1914 the ELSA published the first complete English liturgy to be used in Australia the *Church Liturgy for Evangelical Lutheran Congregations in Australia* (or the *Church Liturgy* for short). This service order was largely influenced by the Missouri Synod.

In 1922 when the ALHB was published the Pg1 order was based on the *Church Liturgy* and the Pg10 order was based on the *Common Order*. The importance of this information is that when the LH was produced, the Pg1LH order (which would later be moved to Pg6 in the LHS) was also based on the *Common Order*. It is this reason why the Pg10 order and the Pg1LH/Pg6 order is very similar. Therefore in our analysis of the four communion orders we will first start by analysing the differences found in these somewhat identical orders. To do this I will be looking at the differences in the Pg10, Pg1LH and Pg6 orders, not including the modernisation of language.

Analysis of Pg10, Pg1LH and Pg6

Confession Absolution

The first difference appears in the Confession-Absolution. The Confession in the LH/S was not taken from the *Common Order* but instead was taken from the *Church Liturgy*. There are, however, differences found in the two orders but I will discuss these when we analyse the Pg1 order. For now we shall look at the differences found in the Pg10 Confession-Absolution. Apart from the wording, there are two significant differences with the Pg10 order. Firstly, in the Pg10 order there are two confessions on sins, one spoken by the minister on behalf of the congregation which is followed by a confession of sins spoken by the congregation. This form of the Confession of sins is picked up and used in the LCA's *The Service Without Communion* (pg18 in the LH and pg23 in the LHS). But the biggest difference is the absolution, or lack of. The Pg10's absolution is not a declaration of absolution by the pastor but simply a reminder that our sins have been forgiven. It is for this reason why the *Church Liturgy's* Confession-Absolution was used. "*The absolution is worded in such a way that it cannot be mistaken as anything other than a performative declaration of absolution by the pastor, rather than a general announcement of grace.*" (Lockwood-Kummerow: 5)

Kyrie

The next difference is found in the Kyrie. The LH/S reintroduced the option of using the Greek. The German orders had originally used the Greek but this practice had dropped out when the orders began to use English. The 'upon us' was also dropped from the Kyrie in order to make the English fit with the reintroduced Greek. The removal of the 'upon us' also emphasises the universal nature of the Kyrie instead of just focusing on the needs of the individual congregation.

Readings

A striking difference between the two communion orders of the ALHB and the two communion orders of the LHS is the absence of the Old Testament Reading. The order's of the ALHB as well as the *Church Liturgy* and the *Common Order* only had the epistle and gospel readings with the rare occasion of an OT reading in the place of the epistle, for example a reading from Isaiah for Good Friday (ALHB: 45). Although, the ALHB does leave the officiant with the option of reading a different Scripture Lesson (ALHB: 13). Also, the lack of an OT reading effects the placement of the Psalm. In the Pg10 order the psalm could be used in one of two places. The first place was instead of the Introit; the Pg10 order gives alternatives to the Introit with the option of replacing it with a psalm or hymn (ALHB: 12). This variation was lost in the LH which only gives the option of singing or speaking the

Introit. The variation was regained in the LHS which gives the option of using a psalm instead of the Introit. The other difference is found in the second placement for the psalm. The Pg1LH and the Pg6 orders give the option of having a psalm in between the OT and NT readings. The Pg10 order doesn't have this option since there is no OT reading, however the lectionary (ALHB: 35-61) provides a psalm as an alternative reading for the week.

But one of the most crucial differences between the ALHB and the LHS in regards to the readings is the responses that follow the readings. In the ALHB and the LH the closing response to the readings was 'here ends the lesson' (or here ends the epistle/gospel), this was changed in the LHS to 'this is the Word of the Lord' (or this is the Gospel of the Lord). Some people may not consider these differences of any importance but 'this is the Word of the Lord' bears a lot of theological importance. The 'is' gives testimony to the inerrancy and inspiration of Scripture. The 'is' of this statement shares the same level of importance as the 'is' in the Words of Institution, and by declaring that 'this is the Word of the Lord' we are making a confessional statement that separates us from those churches who do not confess that the Scriptures are the Word of God (e.g. 'this contains the Word of the Lord').

Prayers

The General Prayers (or Prayer of the Church) were not greatly different in structure, only in their wording. The only major difference between Pg10 and Pg1LH was the addition of the petition for the Holy Spirit. There are, however, a few more changes added into the Pg6's version of the General Prayer. Firstly, the prayer is broken up with responses 'Lord, in your mercy: **hear our prayer**' (LHS: 13-14), these responses serve a practical use, breaking the prayer up into small chunks instead of having one large block. The responses also involves the congregation in the prayers, allowing them to actively participate in the prayer and hopefully allowing them to concentrate on the prayers instead of wandering off in their own thoughts, which is a risk of lengthy prayers. The involvement of the congregation in the prayers also allows the parishioners to recognise ownership of the prayers and their role within the priesthood of all believers. Another minor difference to the prayers is the expansion of the 'let us pray' to the 'let us pray for the whole people of God in Christ Jesus and for all people according to their needs' (LHS:13). This expansion serves no major function but acts as recognition for why we are praying this prayer.

Holy Communion

The Holy Communion order of Pg10 is very similar with the Pg1LH/Pg6 Holy Communion order. There are three main differences. Firstly, the intended introductory hymn for the Service of the Sacrament is 'create in me a clean heart'. The Pg6 order uses 'create in me a clean heart' as the offertory, while the Pg10 order uses 'create in me a clean heart' as an alternative offertory with the main offertory being 'the sacrifices of God are a broken spirit'. The plan here is that 'create in me a clean heart' would not be used on days that Holy Communion is served in order to prevent a doubling up of the hymn. Secondly, the Pg10 order uses an exhortation between the Sanctus and Lord's Prayer. The Pg10 order of the ALHB only uses the longer exhortation, while the ALHB Pg1 order offers a short version. However, this pre-communion exhortation has fallen out of use with the transition from ALHB to LH. It is disappointing that the later orders do not retain the exhortation as I believe this exhortation provides a lot of theological and spiritual benefits. It takes seriously 1 Corinthians 11, where Paul teaches us that we must examine ourselves before taking of the body and blood of Jesus and that if we do not recognise the body and blood of Jesus then we drink judgement upon ourselves. The exhortation also provides a brief teaching on the Lord's Supper, it reaffirms the Lutheran understanding of the Sacrament and it challenges the communicants to take seriously the importance of the meal. This isn't something that a person can play around with, this is the true body and blood of Jesus.

The third difference between the Pg10 and Pg6 communion orders is the dismissal. Which was changed from '*the Body of our Lord Jesus Christ and His precious Blood strengthen and preserve you in the true faith unto everlasting life,*' (ALHB: 26) to '*the body of our Lord Jesus Christ and his precious blood strengthen and preserve you in body and soul to life eternal.*' (LHS: 20) The wording may be slightly different but there are theological

reasonings behind those words. The ALHB order focuses on the Holy Communion's ability to strengthen our faith and to preserve us in the way of truth. The LH/S wording comes from the liturgy of Wilhelm Löhe and was chosen by the committee for its focus on the Holy Communion as a medicine for the body as well as the soul. This, according to Sasse, was the opinion of Luther and the Early Church Fathers. (Lockwood-Kummerow: 7) This wording also focuses on the concept of the complete resurrection of the believer in both body and soul.

Alternatives

Another aspect of the ALHB orders that differs from the Pg6 order is the alternatives offered within the orders. Alternative offers can be seen in the Pg10 order but are more evident in the Pg1 order. The Pg1 order offers hymns that can be sung in place of the Gloria, Lamb of God, the Creed and Sanctus. These variations have been lost in the Pg1LH/Pg6 order which provides only a single option, with very few exceptions. These alternatives have been regained slightly in the Pg58 order which offers a few variations here and there, but a wider use of alternatives has only really been regained with the more contemporary services.

Chief Focus of the Order

In order to discuss the differences in the Pg1 order we need to talk about the chief focus of the orders. The orders of the LHS centre on the Lord's Supper. The chief focus of the service is preparation for the Service of the Sacrament. Everything preceding the Lord's Supper is designed as a leading up to the Sacrament. The orders reflect *"the fact that holy communion is the culmination and completion of the service of the word, not something additional which is tacked on at the end."* (Lockwood-Kummerow: 7) The ALHB orders have a different focus. During the time these orders were used, Communion services were uncommon and only happened a few times during the year. For this reason Holy Communion was not the focus of the service. For the Pg10 order, the Service of the Word and the Service of the Sacrament were two entirely different things, one service centred on the Sermon while the other centred on the Lord's Supper. When there was no Communion the service finished after the prayers with a hymn and the benediction. If there was Communion the Service of the Sacrament followed the prayers as an entirely different order. The ALHB Pg1 order also treats the Service of the Sacrament as an entirely different order, but the chief focus of the entire order is completely different to the other orders. Whether it was a service with or without Communion the chief purpose of the Pg1 order is Confession-Absolution. According to the ALHB, in the Pg1 order the prayers are followed by announcements, a Scriptural blessing, a hymn in which the offering may be collected, the offertory, Confession-Absolution and ending with the benediction. If it is a Holy Communion service then the Service of the Sacrament is inserted between the Scriptural Blessing and the offering hymn. Either way Confession-Absolution is the final climax and chief focus of the order.

Analysis of the Pg1 Order

According to Dr. Renner the Confession of sins is a rite of preparation (:9), but in the ALHB the entire service is seen as a Confession of sins. The order's focus on confessing our sins is evident in the structure and differences from the other orders. According to Renner the Kyrie is not a prayer for forgiveness but rather a beggar's cry for help (:14). However, the Pg1 order treats the Kyrie as a prayer for forgiveness. In most orders the invitation to confess our sins is followed with the Confession-Absolution, but in the Pg1 order the invitation is followed by a Trinitarian Kyrie. Another interesting difference with this order is that after the Gloria and before the greeting and Collect, a different version of the Lamb of God is sung (hymn 108ALHB). The reasoning for this is that while the Kyrie is used as a plea for forgiveness, the Gloria and Lamb of God are then used as a reminder of God's forgiveness achieved through the death and resurrection of Jesus.

As mentioned above, the rite of Confession-Absolution as found in the Pg1LH/Pg6 order was based on the *Church Liturgy* order which is the same as the ALHB Pg1 order, however, there are a few differences.

The first difference is the invitation to confess our sins. The Pg1LH/Pg6 order uses the invitation which the Pg1 order uses prior to the Kyrie. The invitation used for the Confession in the Pg1 order is different; it looks back towards the readings and sermons, "*having heard the Word of God...let us now humble ourselves... and make confession of our sins.*" (Church Liturgy: 11) The invitation also emphasises our frailties and infirmities, the wrath and punishment of God and on our sense of unworthiness. The invitation like the rest of the service is heavily focused on our brokenness and need for repentance.

Another difference that occurred in the LH was the addition of the statement concerning the retention of sins. The warning of the retention of sins was common among the German liturgies but had dropped out of the English orders. There was much debate over the use of this line, but the line '*God forbid that through impenitence and unbelief any among you should reject His grace and forgiveness, and your sins be retained,*' (LH: 2) was added into the *Lutheran Hymnal*. Many people felt that this warning left the Law ringing in their ears rather than the Absolution. Thus in the LHS an alternative Absolution was offered with a softer warning '*to declare to those who do not repent that their sins are not forgiven,*' (LHS: 7) towards the beginning of the Absolution so that the Absolution did not finish with the warning.

As I have repeatedly said, the chief focus of the ALHB Pg1 order is the rite of Confession-Absolution. This focus does not, however, diminish the importance of the Lord's Supper. The Service of the Sacrament, stands separate from the Service of the Word, however, the order's focus of humility and repentance can be seen within the Service of the Sacrament. Firstly, the exhortation calls on the communicants to examine themselves and humble themselves before coming to Holy Communion. Secondly, between the Word's of Institution and the Lamb of God, the pastor prays a Eucharistic prayer, which emphasises our unworthiness to participate in the Lord's Supper, making statements like '*I am not worthy that Thou shouldst come into my heart and make Thine abode with me...*' and '*Thou biddest me to Thy Holy Supper and dost graciously promise me, an unworthy sinner, that I shall receive forgiveness of all my sins...*' (ALHB: 6). This is helpful as it reminds the communicant that those who partake of the Lord's Supper in a prideful and unrepentant way, thinking that they are worthy, are in fact unworthy to receive the Lord's Supper; while those who partake of the Lord's Supper in a humble and repentant way thinking that they are unworthy, are in fact the ones who partake of the Lord's Supper in a worthy manner. For as Luther said, '*this Sacrament does not depend upon our worthiness... on the contrary, we come as poor, miserable people, precisely because we are unworthy. The only exception would be the person who desires no grace and absolution and has no intention of improving.*' (Kolb/Wengert: 473).

One important feature that is strikingly different in the Pg1 order is the dismissal from Holy Communion. As mentioned above, the ALHB Pg10 order says, '*the Body of our Lord Jesus Christ and His precious Blood strengthen and preserve you in the true faith unto everlasting life,*' (ALHB: 26) with a focus on the strengthen of our faith and our preservation in the way of truth. While the LHS Pg6 order says, '*the body of our Lord Jesus Christ and his precious blood strengthen and preserve you in body and soul to life eternal,*' (LHS: 20) with a focus on the Holy Communion as a medicine for the body as well as the soul. The ALHB Pg1 order goes about the dismissal in a different way. In most orders of service the words of distribution follow along the lines of '*take and eat, this is the Body of Christ, given for you*' and '*take and drink, this is the Blood of Christ, shed for you for the forgiveness of sins.*' (LHS: 20, 74). The ALHB Pg10 order basically uses the same wording, except it adds the word '*true*' before '*Body*' and '*Blood*', and instead of saying '*Blood of Christ*' says '*Blood of the New Testament.*' (ALHB: 23). The ALHB Pg1 order instead combines the words of distribution with the dismissal, saying '*Take and eat; this is the true Body of our Lord Jesus Christ, given unto death for your sins; this strengthen and preserve you in true faith unto life eternal. Amen,*' and '*Take and drink this is the true Blood of our Lord Jesus Christ, shed for*

the remission of your sins; this strengthen and preserve you in true faith unto life eternal. Amen.' (ALHB: 7). And then at the end of Holy Communion simply dismisses people with a 'Peace be with you!' (:7).

Between the two hymnals, the *Australian Lutheran Hymn Book* and the *Lutheran Hymnal with Supplement*, the Lutheran churches of Australia have provided us with four different service orders for Holy Communion. The differences in these orders reflect the changes in theology over time. The newer orders emphasis the Lord's Supper and focus more on God's forgiveness, while the older orders emphasis our sinfulness and focus more on the our repentance and need to humble ourselves.

References

Primary Sources

ELCA, (1914). *Church Liturgy for Evangelical Lutheran Congregations in Australia*, The Lutheran Publishing House, Adelaide, SA, Aus

ELCA, (1922). *Australian Lutheran Hymn-Book*, The Lutheran Publishing Co. Ltd. Adelaide, SA, USA

LCA, (1973). *Lutheran Hymnal*, Lutheran Publishing House, Adelaide, SA, AUS

LCA, (1989). *Lutheran Hymnal with Supplement*, Lutheran Publishing House, Adelaide, SA, AUS

Kolb, Robert and Timothy Wengert, (2000). *The Book of Concord: The Confessions of the Evangelical Lutheran Church*. Fortress Press, Minneapolis, MN, USA

Secondary Sources

Leske, Everard, (1996, 2009ed.) *For Faith and Freedom*, Friends of Lutheran Archives, Bowden, SA, Aus

Lockwood, Michael and Jonathon Kummerow, (1998). *The Origin and Nature of the Service with Communion of the LCA, as published in the Lutheran Hymnal, 1973*. LCA: Biblical and Theological Resources, <http://www.lca.org.au/biblical-and-theological-resources.html>

Renner, H.P.V, (1989). *Together in God's Presence*, Lutheran Publishing House, Adelaide, SA, Aus

Schubert, David, (2004). *Aspects of the history of worship in the LCA*. LTJ 38.3 pg100-112. LCA: Biblical and Theological Resources, <http://www.lca.org.au/biblical-and-theological-resources.html>